

NOSB RECOMMENDED DECISION FORM

Form NOPLIST2. Full Board Transmittal to NOP

For NOSB Meeting: May 2008	Substance: Tragacanth Gum																								
A. Evaluation Criteria (Applicability noted for each category; Documentation attached) Criteria Satisfied? (see B below)																									
1. Impact on Humans and Environment	Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A <input type="checkbox"/>																								
2. Essential & Availability Criteria	Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A <input type="checkbox"/>																								
3. Compatibility & Consistency	Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A <input type="checkbox"/>																								
4. Commercial Supply is Fragile or Potentially Unavailable as Organic (only for 606)	Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> N/A <input type="checkbox"/>																								
B. Substance fails criteria? Criteria category: N/A Comments:	C. Proposed Annotation: None Basis for annotation: To meet criteria above: ____ Criteria: _____ Other regulatory criteria: ____ Citation: _____																								
D. Final Board Action & Vote (State Actual Motion): To include Tragacanth Gum, to section 205.606 - Nonorganically produced agricultural products allowed as ingredients in or on processed products labeled as "organic", under section (j) Gums - water extracted only.																									
Motion: Julie Weisman Second :Joe Smillie Yes: 14 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 1																									
<table border="1" style="margin: auto; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">Agricultural</td> <td style="text-align: center; padding: 5px;"><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Nonagricultural</td> <td style="padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Crops</td> <td style="padding: 5px;"></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">Synthetic</td> <td style="padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Not synthetic</td> <td style="text-align: center; padding: 5px;"><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Livestock</td> <td style="padding: 5px;"></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">Allowed¹</td> <td style="text-align: center; padding: 5px;"><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Prohibited²</td> <td style="padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Handling</td> <td style="text-align: center; padding: 5px;"><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">No restriction</td> <td style="text-align: center; padding: 5px;"><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Deferred⁴</td> <td style="padding: 5px;"></td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Rejected³</td> <td style="padding: 5px;"></td> </tr> </table>		Agricultural	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Nonagricultural		Crops		Synthetic		Not synthetic	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Livestock		Allowed ¹	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Prohibited ²		Handling	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No restriction	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Deferred ⁴		Rejected ³	
Agricultural	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Nonagricultural		Crops																					
Synthetic		Not synthetic	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Livestock																					
Allowed ¹	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Prohibited ²		Handling	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>																				
No restriction	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Deferred ⁴		Rejected ³																					
<p>The petition for Tragacanth Gum was complete and showed the material met all evaluation criteria for consideration to be listed in 205.606 (j) gums - water extracted only - of the NOP regulations. (See attached) The material was recommended for listing by a vote of the Handling Committee, and subsequently by a vote of the NOSB at it's May 2008 meeting.</p> <p>1—substance voted to be added as "allowed" on National List on National List to § 205.606 with Annotation (if any): <u>No annotation.</u></p> <p>2—substance to be added to "prohibited" paragraph of National List to § 205. ____ Describe why a prohibited substance: _____</p> <p>3—substance was rejected by vote for amending National List to § 205. ____ Describe why material was rejected: _____</p> <p>4—substance was recommended to be deferred § 205. ____ Describe why deferred; if any follow-up is needed. If follow-up needed, who conducts follow-up _____</p>																									
E. Approved by NOSB Chair to transmit to NOP																									
<u>Rigoberto Delgado.</u> Chair	<u>July 9, 2008</u> Date																								
F. NOP Action: Include in FR to amend National List: Return to NOSB Reason: _____ _____ Date																									

National Organic Standards Board

Final Recommendation for

Date: May 22, 2008

I. List:

National Organic Program Subpart G: The National List of Allowed and Prohibited Substances. §205.606 Nonorganically produced agricultural products allowed as ingredients in or on processed products labeled as “organic” or “made with organic (specified ingredients or food groups(s)).” List in section (j) Gums- water extracted only.

- II. Board Summary:** Tragacanth gum, water-extracted is an exudite gum and is harvested and processed in a manner which is identical to other exudite gums already included on §205.606 of the National List. The Board considered whether it is necessary to add another gum to the National List and was persuaded that although Tragacanth gum is derived by an identical process to gum Arabic, it has sufficiently different functionality to justify its inclusion on the National List.

The Board also considered the reasons for this material being commercially unavailable in an organic form and the prospects for such availability in the future.

At present this tree is primarily cultivated in Iran and the current embargo which exists on U.S. trade with this country had disrupted the supply of even the conventional form of this material. Turkey has increased its production of conventional Tragacanth gum and also is expanding its organic production. The petitioner is working closely with their Turkish supplier and believes that a supply of this material in an organic will be made available in the next several years.

The Board feels that this material meets evaluation criteria in all four categories required for listing on section 205.606 of the National List.

III. Board Recommendation

Tragacanth Gum for inclusion on §205.606 of the National List in Section (j) Gums - water extracted only.

Moved: Julie Weisman Second: Joe Smillie

Board vote: Yes-14 No- 0 Absent- 1 Abstain-0 Recuse-0

NOSB COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

Form NOPLIST1. Committee Transmittal to NOSB

For NOSB Meeting: May 2008

Substance: Tragacanth Gum

Committee: Crops Livestock Handling Petition is for: Inclusion of Tragacanth on the National List § 205.606 (b)

on the National List § 205.

A. Evaluation Criteria (Applicability noted for each category; Documentation attached) **Criteria Satisfied? (see B below)**

- | | | | |
|--|---|-----------------------------|---|
| 1. Impact on Humans and Environment | Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> | N/A <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 2. Essential & Availability Criteria | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> | N/A <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| 3. Compatibility & Consistency | Yes <input type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> | N/A <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| 4. Commercial Supply is Fragile or Potentially Unavailable as Organic (only for 606) | Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | No <input type="checkbox"/> | N/A <input type="checkbox"/> |

B. Substance Fails Criteria Category: _____ **Comments:** _____

C. Proposed Annotation (if any): water extracted only (current annotation for this section).

Basis for annotation: To meet criteria above: _____ Other regulatory criteria: _____ Citation: _____

D. Recommended Committee Action & Vote (State Actual Motion): Recommend Tragacanth Gum for listing on § 205.606 (b) of the National List

Motion by: Julie Weisman Seconded: Steve DeMuri Yes: 6 No: 0 Absent: 0 Abstain: 0

Crops	Agricultural	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Allowed ¹	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Livestock	Non-Synthetic	<input type="checkbox"/>	Prohibited ²	<input type="checkbox"/>
Handling	Synthetic	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Rejected ³	<input type="checkbox"/>
No restriction	Commercially Un-Available as Organic ¹	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Deferred ⁴	<input type="checkbox"/>

1) Substance voted to be added as "allowed" on National List to § 205.606 (b) with Annotation (if any) Water-extracted only (current annotation for this section)

2) Substance to be added as "prohibited" on National List to § 205. _____ with Annotation (if any) _____

Describe why a prohibited substance: _____

3) Substance was rejected by vote for amending National List to § 205. _____ Describe why material was rejected: _____

4) Substance was recommended to be deferred because _____

_____ If follow-up needed, who will follow up _____

E. Approved by Committee Chair to transmit to NOSB:

Julie Weisman
Committee Chair

March 27, 2008
Date

NOSB EVALUATION CRITERIA FOR SUBSTANCES ADDED TO THE NATIONAL LIST

Category 1. Adverse impacts on humans or the environment? Substance - Tragaganth Gum

Question	Yes	No	N/A ¹	Documentation (TAP; petition; regulatory agency; other)
1. Are there adverse effects on environment from manufacture, use, or disposal? [§205.600 b.2]			X	This is an agricultural product.
2. Is there environmental contamination during manufacture, use, misuse, or disposal? [§6518 m.3]		X		
3. Is the substance harmful to the environment? [§6517c(1)(A)(i);6517(c)(2)(A)i]		X		
4. Does the substance contain List 1, 2, or 3 inerts? [§6517 c (1)(B)(ii); 205.601(m)2]		X		
5. Is there potential for detrimental chemical interaction with other materials used? [§6518 m.1]		X		
6. Are there adverse biological and chemical interactions in agro-ecosystem? [§6518 m.5]			X	This is an agricultural product used as an ingredient in an organic processed food. It is no longer in the agro-ecosystem.
7. Are there detrimental physiological effects on soil organisms, crops, or livestock? [§6518 m.5]			X	This is an agricultural product used as an ingredient in an organic processed food. It is no longer in the agro-ecosystem.
8. Is there a toxic or other adverse action of the material or its breakdown products? [§6518 m.2]			X	This is an agricultural product used as an ingredient in an organic processed food. It is no longer in the agro-ecosystem.
9. Is there undesirable persistence or concentration of the material or breakdown products in environment?[§6518 m.2]			X	This is an agricultural product used as an ingredient in an organic processed food. It is no longer in the agro-ecosystem.
10. Is there any harmful effect on human health? [§6517 c (1)(A)(i) ; 6517 c(2)(A)i; §6518 m.4]		X		Tragaganth Gum is considered GRAS by the FDA (CFR 21 § 182.10
11. Is there an adverse effect on human health as defined by applicable Federal regulations? [205.600 b.3]		X		
12. Is the substance GRAS when used according to FDA's good manufacturing practices? [§205.600 b.5]	X			See # 10 above.
13. Does the substance contain residues of heavy metals or other contaminants in excess of FDA tolerances? [§205.600 b.5]		X		

¹If the substance under review is for crops or livestock production, all of the questions from 205.600 (b) are N/A—not applicable.

Category 2. Is the Substance Essential for Organic Production? Substance - Tragaganth Gum

Question	Yes	No	N/A¹	Documentation (TAP; petition; regulatory agency; other)
1. Is the substance formulated or manufactured by a chemical process? [6502 (21)]			X	This is an agricultural product.
2. Is the substance formulated or manufactured by a process that chemically changes a substance extracted from naturally occurring plant, animal, or mineral, sources? [6502 (21)]			X	This is an agricultural product.
3. Is the substance created by naturally occurring biological processes? [6502 (21)]	X			Petition p.2 #5 states “ the gum naturally exudes during harvest season through openings in the plants bark as a means of protection.”
4. Is there a natural source of the substance? [§205.600 b.1]			X	Petitioned substance is from a natural source.
5. Is there an organic substitute? [§205.600 b.1]		X		Petition p.3 #11 describes that organic locust bean, arabic and guar gums are available but these do not hold up as well as petitioned material under certain temperatures and Ph levels.
6. Is the substance essential for handling of organically produced agricultural products? [§205.600 b.6]			X	
7. Is there a wholly natural substitute product? [§6517 c (1)(A)(ii)]			X	Petitioned material is wholly natural.
8. Is the substance used in handling, not synthetic, but not organically produced? [§6517 c (1)(B)(iii)]	X			
9. Is there any alternative substances? [§6518 m.6]		X		
10. Is there another practice that would make the substance unnecessary? [§6518 m.6]		X		

¹If the substance under review is for crops or livestock production, all of the questions from 205.600 (b) are N/A—not applicable.

Category 3. Is the substance compatible with organic production practices? Substance - Tragacanth Gum Extract

Question	Yes	No	N/A ¹	Documentation (TAP; petition; regulatory agency; other)
1. Is the substance compatible with organic handling? [§205.600 b.2]	X			Attachment # 2 is an article describing the cultivation, harvest and processing of gum tragacanth as being identical to gum Arabic, which is already included on the National List § 205.606.
2. Is the substance consistent with organic farming and handling? [§6517 c (1)(A)(iii); 6517 c (2)(A)(ii)]	X			
3. Is the substance compatible with a system of sustainable agriculture? [§6518 m.7]	X			
4. Is the nutritional quality of the food maintained with the substance? [§205.600 b.3]	X			
5. Is the primary use as a preservative? [§205.600 b.4]		X		
6. Is the primary use to recreate or improve flavors, colors, textures, or nutritive values lost in processing (except when required by law, e.g., vitamin D in milk)? [205.600 b.4]		XX		Used to create textures in processed products to meet consumer expectations of those types of products, not to restore texture lost during processing.
7. Is the substance used in production, and does it contain an active synthetic ingredient in the following categories:			X	
a. copper and sulfur compounds;			X	
b. toxins derived from bacteria;			X	
c. pheromones, soaps, horticultural oils, fish emulsions, treated seed, vitamins and minerals?			X	
d. livestock parasiticides and medicines?			X	
e. production aids including netting, tree wraps and seals, insect traps, sticky barriers, row covers, and equipment cleaners?			X	

¹If the substance under review is for crops or livestock production, all of the questions from 205.600 (b) are N/A—not applicable.

Category 4. Is the commercial supply of an agricultural substance as organic, fragile or potentially unavailable? [§6610, 6518, 6519, 205.2, 205.105 (d), 205.600 (c) 205.2, 205.105 (d), 205.600 (c)] **Substance -Tragacanth Gum**

Question	Yes	No	N/A	Comments on Information Provided (sufficient, plausible, reasonable, thorough, complete, unknown)
1. <u>Is the comparative description provided</u> as to why the non-organic form of the material /substance is necessary for use in organic handling?	XX			Petition p. 3 #11 describes that other gums are available in organic form but these do not hold up as well as petitioned material under certain temperatures and Ph levels required for the production of the sauces and dressing made by the petitioner.
2. Does the current and historical industry information, research, or evidence provided explain how or why the material /substance cannot be obtained organically in the appropriate form to fulfill an essential function in a system of organic handling?	XX			See #1 above.
3. Does the current and historical industry information, research, or evidence provided explain how or why the material /substance cannot be obtained organically in the appropriate quality to fulfill an essential function in a system of organic handling?		X		
4. Does the current and historical industry information, research, or evidence provided explain how or why the material /substance cannot be obtained organically in the appropriate quantity to fulfill an essential function in a system of organic handling?		X		
5. Does the industry information provided on material / substance non-availability as organic, include (but not limited to) the following: a. Regions of production (including factors such as climate and number of regions);	XX			Petition p. 4 “Justification Statement” describes that” although [gum tragacanth] is capable of being produced by organic methods it is not currently being cultivated under organic certification....Nearly all the gum tragacanth produced in the world comes from Iran and neighboring countries.” The petitioner states that the non-organic gum tragacanth they currently use comes from Turkey and that the amount of organic agriculture taking place in Turkey is increasing. The petitioner states that Turkey is capable of providing a supply of organic gum tragacanth and that they (the petitioner) are actively seeking such a supply.
b. Number of suppliers and amount produced;	XX			Petition p. 4 “Justification Statement” names two suppliers of gums. One, TIC Gums choses not to sell Tragacanth gum at all, the other, Gumix International can only obtain Tragacanth gum in non-organic form.
c. Current and historical supplies related to weather events such as hurricanes, floods, and droughts that may temporarily halt production or destroy crops or supplies;		XX		Petitioner does not indicate that weather events are a factor affecting the supply of Tragacanth gum in organic form.
d. Trade-related issues such as evidence of hoarding, war, trade barriers, or civil unrest that may temporarily restrict supplies; or	XX			Petition p. 4 “Justification Statement” describes that “the United States has trade embargoes in place with Iran and other Middle Eastern countries which limits.... the trade of non-organic gum tragacanth, let alone an organic form.”
e. Are there other issues which may present a challenge to a consistent supply?				